

Refuting the suspicion of citing the Prophet's grave as evidence and differentiating between the approach of the ancients and the moderns

رد شبهة الاستدلال بقبر النبي (صلى الله عليه وسلم) والتمييز بين منهج القدماء والمحدثين

Bara'a Sami Zidane<sup>1,\*</sup>, 

<sup>1</sup> Anbar University, College of Education for Girls, Department of Quranic Sciences

براء سامي زيدان<sup>\*١</sup>

<sup>١</sup> جامعة الانبار، كلية التربية بنات، قسم علوم القرآن

## ABSTRACT

This research addresses two misconceptions in Islamic jurisprudence and theology: the use of the Prophet Muhammad's (PBUH) grave within the Prophet's Mosque in Madinah as evidence for permitting the construction of mosques over graves, and the alleged distinction between the methodologies of early and later scholars in evaluating hadith. The first part of the research refutes the argument that the Prophet's grave being located in the mosque justifies the practice of building shrines over the graves of righteous people. It demonstrates that the Prophet's burial was not intended to promote veneration of graves but was carried out with the aim of preventing future idolatry. The second part examines the claim that later scholars merely apply fixed rules in hadith authentication, whereas earlier scholars relied on contextual evidence. The research asserts that the use of contextual cues (al-qarā'in) is integral to the hadith evaluation process, particularly when a narration deviates from established criteria.

Through the examination of authentic narrations from hadith collections such as Sahih al-Bukhari and Sahih Muslim, and the analysis of Islamic jurisprudential texts, the study concludes that both the prohibition of constructing mosques over graves and the continued adherence to scholarly methodologies for hadith authentication are consistent with the practices and teachings of early Islamic scholars. The research aims to clarify these issues, emphasizing the importance of preserving the purity of the Islamic tradition and the integrity of prophetic teachings.

## خلاصة

يتناول هذا البحث مفهومين خاطئين في الفقه والعقيدة الإسلامية: استخدام قبر النبي محمد (صلى الله عليه وسلم) داخل المسجد النبوي كدليل على جواز بناء المساجد على القبور، والتفريق المزعوم بين منهجية العلماء المتقدمين والمتأخرين في تقييم الحديث. يتناول الجزء الأول من البحث الرد على الحجة التي تقول إن وجود قبر النبي في المسجد يبرر بناء الأضرحة على قبور الصالحين، ويثبت أن دفن النبي (صلى الله عليه وسلم) كان بعيداً عن هدف تشجيع عبادة القبور أو تقديسها، بل كان لتجنب الغلو فيها. أما الجزء الثاني فيناقش الشبهة التي تزعم أن العلماء المتأخرين يستخدمون القواعد الثابتة فقط في تصحيح وتضعيف الأحاديث بينما كان العلماء المتقدمين يعتمدون على القرائن والسياقات، مؤكداً أن استخدام القرائن يعد جزءاً أساسياً من منهج التقييم للحديث في حالة مخالفة الحديث للقاعدة المعتمدة.

من خلال دراسة الأحاديث الصحيحة الواردة في كتب الحديث مثل صحيح البخاري وصحيح مسلم، وتحليل النصوص الفقهية، يخلص البحث إلى أن كل من تحريمه لبناء المساجد على القبور والتمسك بالمنهجية العلمية في تصحيح الحديث متسقان مع ممارسات وتعاليم العلماء الأوائل. يهدف البحث إلى توضيح هذه المسائل والتأكيد على أهمية الحفاظ على نقاء السنة النبوية.

## Keywords

### الكلمات المفتاحية

grave worship, Prophet's grave, hadith correction, Islamic jurisprudence, al-qarain

عبادة القبر، قبر الرسول، تصحيح الحديث، الفقه الإسلامي، القرائن

### Received

استلام البحث

1/4/2024

### Accepted

قبول النشر

21/5/2024

### Published online

النشر الإلكتروني

20/6/2024

## 1. INTRODUCTION

All praise is due to Allah, who revealed the Book as a clear explanation of everything and sent His Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) as a proof for His creation. Allah made obedience to Him obligatory, and following the path of His Prophet the way to salvation. I send my blessings and peace upon the one sent with guidance and the religion of truth, to prevail over all other religions, even if the disbelievers dislike it.

Indeed, Allah established this religion with two foundational pillars: the Book of Allah and the Sunnah of His Prophet, a consensus upheld by the people of Islam. Those who oppose this Shariah often raise objections to these pillars, sometimes questioning the Qur'an and casting doubts upon its authenticity, and at other times, attacking the Sunnah by doubting its authority. One such objection is the erroneous use of the Prophet's (PBUH) grave within the mosque as evidence to justify building mosques over graves.

Another issue is the false claim that there is a significant difference between the methodologies of early and later scholars in evaluating hadiths, particularly regarding the use of contextual evidence and fixed principles. These and similar doubts continue to circulate, and due to the popularity of such misconceptions, it is important to address them through research and scholarly writing.

In this work, I aim to address these doubts and provide clear responses based on scholarly sources. The research is divided into two main sections:

Refuting the argument that the Prophet's grave (PBUH) justifies building mosques over graves.

Refuting the claim of a methodological distinction between early and later scholars in the use of fixed principles and contextual evidence.

I have endeavoured to thoroughly examine these doubts, and by Allah's grace and guidance, I present my responses. I do not claim perfection in this work, but I have given it my best effort in defending the noble Sunnah, to which I am honored to belong. I ask Allah for success and acceptance in this endeavor. Indeed, He is the One capable of granting success. All praise is due to Allah, the Lord of the worlds.

Refuting the suspicion of citing the grave of the Messenger, may God bless him and grant him peace, as evidence for making graves into mosques The suspicion and its response: -

The evidence of the presence of the grave of the Messenger, may God bless him and grant him peace, inside the building of the Prophet's Mosque is that it is permissible to make graves into mosques, so building shrines for the righteous is permissible based on what happened in the Prophet's Mosque.

The answer to it and its response:

There is no doubt that the Prophet Muhammad (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) forbade taking graves as mosques, praying at them, seeking intercession with them, or worshipping the occupants of those graves. There are many authentic hadiths that have been reported about the prohibition of taking graves as mosques, including:

1. Abdullah bin Maslamah narrated to us, on the authority of Malik, on the authority of Ibn Shihab, on the authority of Saeed bin Al-Musayyib, on the authority of Abu Hurayrah: The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be upon him) said: "May Allah fight the Jews, they took the graves of their prophets as mosques" ((Ibn Battel,2005).
2. He narrated to us Abu Al-Yaman said: Shu'ayb informed us, on the authority of Al-Zuhri, on the authority of `Ubaydullah bin `Abdullah bin `Utbah, that `Aishah and `Abdullah bin `Abbas said: When the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, was afflicted, he began to throw his cloak over his face, and whenever he felt distressed by it, he would uncover his face and say while he was doing so: "The curse of Allah be upon the Jews." And the Christians, they took the graves of their prophets as places of worship." He warns against what they did. (Ibn Battel,2005)
3. Al-Salt bin Muhammad narrated to us, Abu Awana narrated to us, on the authority of Hilal al-Wazzan, on the authority of Urwah bin al-Zubayr, on the authority of Aisha, may Allah be pleased with her, who said: The Prophet, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, said during his illness from which he did not recover: "May Allah curse the Jews, for they took the graves of their prophets as places of worship." Aisha said: "Had it not been for that, his grave would have been made prominent, for he feared that..." It is taken as a mosque (Ibn Battel,2005).
4. Abu Bakr bin Abi Shaybah and Ishaq bin Ibrahim narrated to us - and the wording is from Abu Bakr. Ishaq said: He told us, and Abu Bakr said: - Zakariya bin Adi narrated to us, on the authority of Ubaidullah bin Amr, on the authority of Zaid bin Abi Anisa, on the authority of Amr bin Murrah, on the authority of Abdullah bin Al-Harith Al-Najrani, who said: Jundub narrated to me, he said: I heard the Prophet, may God bless him and grant him peace, five days before he died, saying: "I declare my innocence before God that I have a close friend among you, for God Almighty has taken me as a close friend, just as He took Abraham as a close friend. If I were to take a close friend from my nation, I would have taken Abu Bakr as a close friend. Beware, those who came before you used to take the graves of their prophets and righteous people as places of worship. Beware, do not take graves as places of worship, for I forbid you from that" (Sahih Muslim ,2008)

As for what is related to the grave of the Prophet, may God bless him and grant him peace, he was not buried in the mosque, but rather it was settled there. The opinion of the Companions (may Allah be pleased with them) on his burial (peace be upon him) in the room of Lady Aisha, and that was for two reasons:

- First: What came in the hadith of Ibn Abi Malekah, on the authority of Aisha, she said: When the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) passed away, they differed about his burial, so Abu Bakr said: I heard from the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) something that I have not forgotten, he said: Allah did not take a prophet except in the place in which he loved to be buried, bury him in the place of his bed. (Sarwari,2023)
- Second: Fear of attachment to his grave and exaggeration in it over time, so that was a way of blocking the means as in the hadith of Lady Aisha mentioned above, she said: “Had it not been for that, his grave would have been made prominent for fear that it would be taken as a mosque.” Narrated by Al-Bukhari (previously graduated).

The room of Lady Aisha was independent of the Prophet's Mosque in its walls and in itself, and it had two doors, one of which opened from the west, i.e. the Prophet's Mosque, and the other to the north (Al-Fatih, 2009). During the reign of Caliph Omar and Othman (may Allah be pleased with them), the mosque was expanded, but it did not affect the rooms of the mothers of the Believers (may Allah be pleased with them), including the room of Lady Aisha, in which his grave (may Allah's prayers and peace be upon him) is located. During the reign of Al-Walid bin Abdul Malik (may Allah have mercy on him), another expansion was carried out by his agent Omar bin Abdul Aziz (may Allah have mercy on him), and it included the western and northern sides and part of the southern side, as well as the expansion of the eastern side for the first time. The rooms of the mothers of the Believers (may Allah be pleased with them) surrounded the mosque except for the western side, which was demolished and incorporated into the mosque. As for the room of Lady Aisha (may Allah be pleased with her), it remained as it was. Omar bin Abdul Aziz (may Allah have mercy on him) demolished its wall and then rebuilt it more tightly than before. Then he built a high pentagonal wall on it, two sides of which meet on the northern side in a triangular shape. The reason for that is two things:

- First: So that the image of the worshipper behind the room would not be the image of the worshipper towards the grave.
- Second: So that its appearance would not be like the appearance of the Kaaba.

During the reign of Al-Zahir Baybars, a niche was built on this wall and the area behind it on the northern side, which is the location of Fatima's house (may Allah be pleased with her), which is a wooden wall. Then it was rebuilt and became a mesh of iron latticework from all sides of the room except for the direction of the qibla, where copper windows were built there. This is what is seen around the room today (Shukr, Salah al-Din bin Abbas, 2005). These three walls (the wall of the room, the pentagonal wall next to it, and the iron mesh wall) all surrounded the grave of the Prophet (may God bless him and grant him peace). God protected it with them from being an idol that was worshipped, in response from God Almighty to His Prophet (may God bless him and grant him peace) when he supplicated: “O God, do not make my grave an idol. May God curse a people who took the graves of their prophets as places of worship.” (Al-Albani, without)

So: After what has been mentioned, no one should use the grave of the Prophet (peace be upon him) as evidence and build a mosque on the shrines of the righteous, because all of this is reprehensible and contrary to the guidance of the Prophet (peace be upon him).

The suspicion of some contemporary scholars about differentiating between the approach of the early and later scholars by adopting circumstantial evidence and rules.

- The text of the suspicion:

The early scholars of hadith authenticate and weaken hadiths according to specific circumstantial evidence for each hadith, and each critic has his own circumstantial evidence. As for the later scholars of hadith, they only authenticate and weaken hadiths according to rules they took from the early scholars, so they began to argue with the early scholars in their rulings. The response to this suspicion:

Neglecting the hadith rules or trying to belittle them is clear confusion, because saying circumstantial evidence is binding on saying and acknowledging the rules. The critic resorted to circumstantial evidence only because this narration deviated from the rule or because this narration needed circumstantial evidence. The agreed upon rules by which an authentic hadith is known are the connection of the chain of transmission, the narrator's integrity and his accuracy. If an authentic hadith comes with different narrations, there are indications to distinguish the preserved from the anomalous. Therefore, the condition of being free from anomalousness and defect was added. Anomalousness is not known except by an indication that turns the connection into a break, or accuracy into lack of accuracy, such as the indication of the most reliable or the most numerous. Ibn Hajar (may Allah have mercy on him) said: “As for the contradiction, from which anomalousness and strangeness arise, if the reliable and truthful narrates something, then it is narrated by someone who is more reliable than him or more numerous, contrary to what was narrated, such that it is impossible to combine according to the rules of the hadith scholars, then this is anomalous. The contradiction may be severe or the accuracy may be weak, so what is contradicted may be ruled as strange.” Al-Mu'alimi (may Allah have mercy on him) said: “The most apparent meaning of the narration of a trustworthy person is correct, and it is necessary to rule accordingly unless a valid argument is established for the error.” (Abd al-Rahman ibn Yahya, 1958).

## 2. CONCLUSION

Praise be to Allah, by whose blessings good deeds are accomplished. Praise be to Allah, who made it easy for me how to respond by distinguishing Statements on the suspicion of following the Prophet's grave (peace be upon him) in making graves into mosques

The research included many benefits, including:

1. The evidence of the presence of the Prophet's grave (peace be upon him) near the Prophet's Mosque is not an argument for making the graves of the righteous into mosques.
2. The commitment of the honorable companions to the saying of the Prophet (peace be upon him) that the prophets are buried in the place where they died.
3. The necessity of adhering to the Prophet's Sunnah and taking into account the authentic hadiths that were transmitted regarding not making graves into mosques.
4. It is the duty of the rulers of the Muslims in our time to remove all mosques that are on graves and that the graves have no construction at all, as the graves were in the era of the Prophet (peace be upon him) in Al-Baqi', not prominent and had nothing on them, despite the high status of their owners, as they are the companions of the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him) and among them are those who were promised Paradise.
5. The necessity of educating the general public and the ignorant that graves do not fulfill needs, cure diseases, benefit those who visit them, please them, or respond to those who seek their help. Whoever does this has committed polytheism, God forbid.

### Funding:

The study was conducted independently without any monetary support from third-party organizations or sponsors. The authors declare that no external funding was provided for this research.

### Conflicts of Interest:

The authors declare no competing interests.

### Acknowledgment:

The authors would like to thank their institutions for their moral support and provision of critical resources throughout the research process.

## References

- [1] A. bin K. bin A. M. Ibn Battel, Explanation of Sahih Al-Bukhari, 2005.
- [2] A. H. Siddiqui, Translation of Sahih Muslim, University of Southern California, Center for Muslim-Jewish Engagement. Available: [www.usc.edu/schools/college/crcc/engagement/resources/texts/muslim/hadith/muslim](http://www.usc.edu/schools/college/crcc/engagement/resources/texts/muslim/hadith/muslim), 2008.
- [3] A. S. Sarwari, "Imam al-Tirmidhi and his methodology in the book of Sunan," Jami Scientific Research Quarterly Journal, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 27–42, 2023.
- [4] M. N. Al-Fatih, "Investigation of the book Wafa al-Wafa between critic and defender: The response to Dr. Sulayman al-Ruhaili's criticism of my investigation of the book Wafa al-Wafa," 2009.
- [5] S. al-D. bin A. Shukr, Ibn al-Najjar and his book Ad-Durrah At-Thamina fi Akhbar Al-Madinah, 2005.
- [6] Narrated by Ahmad in Musnad, vol. 12, p. 314, no. 3844, and Al-Albani said about it: "The hadith is authentic, there is no doubt about it." See Ahkam Al-Jana'iz, p. 217, and Malik narrated it in Al-Muwatta', no. 414, on the authority of Ata' bin Yasar, with the wording: "O Allah, do not make my grave an idol that is worshipped."
- [7] A. A.-R. bin Y. Al-Mu'alimi and M. Abu Rayya, Al-Anwar Al-Kashifa li-ma fi Kitab "Adwaa 'ala Al-Sunnah" min Al-Zalal, Al-Mislaah, and Al-Jazifa, 1958.

## مراجع

- [١] ابن بطل، شرح صحيح البخاري، ٢٠٠٥.
- [٢] أ. هـ. صديقي، ترجمة صحيح مسلم، جامعة جنوب كاليفورنيا، مركز التفاعل الإسلامي اليهودي. متاح على الرابط : [www.usc.edu/schools/college/crcc/engagement/resources/texts/muslim/hadith/muslim](http://www.usc.edu/schools/college/crcc/engagement/resources/texts/muslim/hadith/muslim)، ٢٠٠٨.
- [٣] أ. س. سرواري، "الإمام الترمذي ومنهجه في كتاب السنن"، مجلة البحث العلمي الجامعي الفصلي، المجلد ٨، العدد ١، الصفحات ٢٧-٤٢، ٢٠٢٣.
- [٤] م. ن. الفاتح، "تحقيق كتاب وفاء الوفا بين الناقد والمدافع: الرد على انتقاد الدكتور سليمان الرحيلي لتحقيق كتاب وفاء الوفا"، ٢٠٠٩.
- [٥] س. الد. بن أ. شكر، ابن النجار وكتابه الدرّة الثمينة في أخبار المدينة، ٢٠٠٥.
- [٦] رواه أحمد في مسند، المجلد ١٢، الصفحة ٣١٤، رقم ٣٨٤٤، وقال الألباني عنه: "الحديث صحيح لا شك فيه". انظر أحكام الجنائز، الصفحة ٢١٧، ومالك رواه في الموطأ، رقم ٤١٤، عن عطاء بن يسار بلفظ: "اللهم لا تجعل قبري وثناً يُعبد."
- [٧] أ. ع. ر. بن ي. المعلمي ومحمد أبو رية، الأنوار الكاشفة لما في كتاب "أضواء على السنة" من الضلال، المصلح والجاذفة، ١٩٥٨.